

Examination of the Responses to Reviewers' Comments of IPCC WG I Report

John McLean

5 July 2007

1. The Freedom of Information laws in the USA have forced the publication of the comments by the IPCC's expert reviewers for the report by Working Group I (WG I). These comments are now online (see footnote ¹) but one wonders if this material would have been released had it been stored in a country without similar legislation because the corresponding comments were not released for previous IPCC reports.
2. All reviewers were able to comment on First Order Revision (FOR) and Second Order Revision (SOR) of chapters 1 to 11 of the IPCC WG I report. They also reviewed the Technical Summary Report (TSR) and the Second Order Revision (SOR) of the Summary for Policy makers (SPM) but only government representatives reviewed the Final Draft (FDR) of the SPM and no responses were made for that FDR.
3. The preface to the comments for each revision of each chapter says "...These comments and responses are not to be edited and/ or redistributed in part or in full to others. ..." but contents of the IPCC report were leaked to the media prior to formal release and the IPCC did themselves a disservice by releasing the Summary for Policy-makers (SPM), approved by government representatives, and delayed the releasing the parts written and approved by scientists until those parts conformed to the contents of the SPM.
4. Reviewers' comment vary in scope from praise for the chapter or sections thereof, to noting spelling or grammatical errors, to asking for the revision or removal of large passages of text. The responses to these comments likewise varies from acknowledgement of praise, to comments that changes are planned, to statements about why changes will not be made.

Examples:

Reviewer - "Title is not accurate ..."

Response - "Title cannot be changed ..."

Reviewer - "Replace 'very likely' by 'most unlikely'"

Response - "Rejected: no basis given for the assertion"

Response - "Noted, but disagree" (or "Noted, but not changed")

Response - "We have room for only limited discussion of ..."

Response - "Still speculative"

Reviewer - "Having read all 11 chapters of the draft Report, I had intended to provide review comments on them all. However, I became so angry at the need to point out the above elementary principles that I abandoned the review at this point: the draft should be withdrawn and replaced by another that displays an adequate level of scientific competence."

5. The rejection of reviewers' comments comes in all forms including "Noted but disagree" (or similar) , redirections to other responses, comment that the substance of the reviewer's is dealt

¹ see <http://ipcc-wg1.ucar.edu/wg1/Comments/wg1-commentFrameset.html>

with elsewhere, that space constraints prevent the inclusion of certain material, that the reviewers' comments lack justification and so on. In some chapters the responses are terse but in others the responses are detailed especially where a reviewers' comment is being dismissed or rejected. This variety of responses no doubt comes from the differing authorship team for each chapter.

6. In many instances one gets the impression that reviewers had to justify their requests for substantial changes (i.e. not spelling or grammatical errors, or requests for clarification) but the chapter authors did not have to justify the material they had written and in particular their interpretations or opinions.
7. The use of the word "rejected" provides an indication of the responses to reviewers' comments that disagreed with the text of the target draft.

The table below lists the number of reviewer responses to the first and second order drafts (FOR and SOR) of each chapter along with the number of times the word "rejected" appears in the PDF file dealing with each FOR or SOR. (The number of instances of "reject" or "disagree" appears in parentheses but the omission of the parentheses should not be taken as indicating whether a search was made for those words.) Given that other forms of rejection are also present (see point 5 above) the actual number of rejected comments could be substantially higher than indicated in this table but it is simply not practical to examine each response to more than 11,000 comments and make a subjective assessment of the extent of rejection.

Chapter	First Order Revision (FOR)		Second Order Revision (SOR)	
	Total comments	Rejects	Total Comments	Rejects
1	899	152	554	152
2	2732	242	1313	230
3	2231	221 (49)	1256	349
4	1137	63	516	108
5	1204	35	635	76
6	1789	229	1112	339
7	1751	102	974	113
8	963	143 (28)	794	123 (36)
9	1436	220 (7)	1157	638
10	1331	70	1331	309
11	1458	12 (87)	1647	131
SPM (*)	-	-	1455	312
TSR (**)	-	-	1333	330

(*) Only government representatives reviewed the final draft of the SPM and made 907 comments, but the document was already finalised and the comments had no impact.

(**) Only the SOR of the Technical Summary Report (TSR) was reviewed

8. The progression from the FOR to the SOR saw no increase in the total number of reviewers' comments for any chapter, but for 9 of the 11 chapters the number of rejected comments increased and that ignores comments rejected using other wording. Admittedly there may be valid and logical reasons for this which have nothing to do with dissatisfaction with the progress of the document.
9. For the SOR of chapter 9, titled "Understanding and Attributing Climate Change", more than 55% of reviewers' comments were rejected, as were 30% of comments for the SOR of chapter

6 ("Paleoclimate", i.e. historical climate) and almost 28% comments for the SOR of chapter 3 ("Observations: Surface and Atmospheric Climate Change"). For seven of the eleven chapters the number of rejected comments exceeds 20% when the additional words were included for chapter 8 (see table above). And don't forget that in each instance other words may have been used to reject even more comments.

10. The Appendix to this document shows a table listing the number of comments by each reviewer for each chapter. From that table the following were determined in relation to the 309 reviewers recorded.

125 reviewers made fewer than 10 comments,
260 reviewers made fewer than 50 comments
287 reviewers made fewer than 100 comments
so only 22 reviewers made more than 100 comments

143 reviewers commented on just 1 chapter
215 reviewers commented on fewer than 3 chapters
277 reviewers commented on fewer than 5 chapters
and just 16 reviewers commented on more than 7 chapters
only 5 reviewers commented on all 11 chapters

In other words 84% of reviewers (260 of 309) made fewer than 50 comments for the entire 11 chapters (940 pages) and 70% of reviewers (215 of 309) commented only on 1 or 2 chapters.

The greatest number of reviewers for any chapter was 101 for chapter 2, "Changes in Atmospheric Constituents and in Radiative Forcing", and the least was just 34 for chapter 4, "Observations: Changes in Snow, Ice and Frozen Ground". The most important chapter was number 9, "Understanding and Attributing Climate Change" but it received comments from just 62 reviewers and only four chapters received fewer comments.

11. Were many of the reviewers so satisfied with the chapters that they made no effort to comment, in other words should we take the absence of comments to indicate approval? What are we to make of the fact that more than 20% of reviewers' comments for 7 of the 11 chapters were rejected and often with no reason?

Chapter 9 dealt with the attribution of climate change and was key to the claim of a 90% to 95% probability that humans were responsible for warming and yet just 62 reviewers made comments, more than half of which (33) made three comments or fewer for the 84-page chapter.

We've been led to believe that the review was an extensive process undertaken by diligent experts from virtually every country and that if those experts were not unanimous then they were very close to it. It is very disappointing to discover that despite the crucial nature of the report the reality is very different.

APPENDIX

List of reviewers and numbers of comments for each chapter SOR (not the TSR or SPM). This data was supplied by Bob Koss to "Climate Audit" (see <http://www.climateaudit.org/?p=1790>) and I obtained it as file http://www.climateaudit.org/data/ipcc/ipcc_sod.commenters.csv. Government representatives are noted for only 23 countries.

No.	Name	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	Total
1	European Commission	0	18	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	47	0	65
2	A. Brett Mullan	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	3
3	Adrian Simmons	7	15	42	7	8	10	10	11	10	24	19	163
4	Aixue Hu	0	0	0	0	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	3
5	Akio Kito	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	7
6	Akira Noda	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	4	0	0	9	14
7	Alan Robock	0	0	9	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	9
8	Alexander Trishchenko	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
9	Alicia M. Lavin	0	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
10	Anders Levermann	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	0	10
11	Andreas Sterl	0	0	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
12	Andrew Lacic	4	2	0	0	1	3	3	0	1	3	0	17
13	Andrey Ganopolski	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	0	5
14	Anthony Hirst	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	14	0	14
15	Atle Nesje	0	0	0	1	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	8
16	Bart Van den Hurk	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	128	130
17	Bette Otto-Bliesner	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	0	5
18	Bjorn Stevens	0	2	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	6
19	Blair Trewin	0	0	84	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	84
20	Brian Soden	4	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	4	0	0	13
21	Bruce Wielicki	0	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
22	C Neil Roberts	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1
23	Carles Pelejero	0	0	0	0	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	12
24	Caroline Leck	0	23	0	0	0	0	11	0	0	0	0	34
25	Chiu-Ying LAM	0	0	4	0	5	0	0	0	0	12	5	26
26	Chris Folland	0	0	69	91	39	0	0	0	0	0	0	199
27	Chris Jones	0	6	0	0	0	0	20	0	0	26	0	52
28	Christian-D. Schoenwiese	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5
29	Christof Appenzeller	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
30	Christoph Beck	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
31	Christopher Sabine	0	0	0	0	3	0	6	0	0	0	0	9
32	Chuck Hakkari	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	2
33	Claire Waelbroeck	0	0	0	0	0	15	0	0	0	0	0	15
34	Claudia Marcolli	0	27	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	27
35	Cliff Law	0	0	0	0	0	0	25	0	0	0	0	25
36	Connie Woodhouse	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	6
37	Constanta Emilia Boroneant	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5
38	Constantin Mares	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	15	15
39	Corinne Le Quere	0	2	0	0	0	0	17	0	0	11	0	30
40	Daithi Stone	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	25	0	27	54
41	Dan Hughes	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	2
42	Daniel Caya	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	88	88
43	Daniel Murphy	0	7	0	0	0	0	22	0	0	0	0	29
44	Danny Harvey	0	27	0	0	6	10	0	10	11	15	0	79
45	Dave Rowell	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2	45	49
46	David Parker	63	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	28	0	0	91
47	David Rind	0	0	12	11	19	0	0	27	32	0	0	101
48	David Sexton	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	11	0	14
49	David Wratt & David Fahey	20	6	26	8	2	10	8	6	8	20	9	123
50	Dennis Hartmann	4	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	7
51	Detlef Stammer	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
52	Dian Seidel	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
53	Donald L. Forbes	0	0	0	0	14	0	0	0	0	10	0	24
54	Drew Shindell	0	2	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	7
55	Dylan Millet	0	12	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12
56	Eduardo Zorita	0	0	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	3
57	Eric Guilyardi	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	0	5
58	Eric Martin	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2
59	Eric Steig	0	0	0	0	0	26	0	0	0	0	0	26

60	Eric Wolff	0	2	0	0	0	59	0	0	0	0	0	61
61	Erik Kjellström	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	46	46
62	Eva Bauer	0	0	0	0	0	16	0	0	0	0	0	16
63	Eva Calvo	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	6
64	Expédit Wilfrid VISSIN	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1
65	Fons Baede	0	0	13	0	0	0	0	0	25	0	0	38
66	Francis Zwiers	0	0	0	32	0	0	0	76	0	0	134	242
67	Franklin SCHWING	3	0	3	0	4	0	4	1	0	0	1	16
68	Frederick Nelson	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	7
69	Friedrich Schott	0	0	1	0	15	0	0	0	0	0	0	16
70	gabi hegerl	14	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	0	21
71	Galina Churkina	0	0	4	0	0	0	17	0	0	0	0	21
72	Gareth S. Jones	5	19	37	0	0	5	0	10	49	5	0	130
73	Gavin Schmidt	0	2	0	0	0	9	0	0	0	7	0	18
74	Georgii Alexandrov	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1
75	Gerrit Burgers	0	0	1	0	3	0	0	0	0	14	0	18
76	Gian-Kasper Plattner	0	3	0	0	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	15
77	Gill Martin	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	13	0	0	0	13
78	Giuseppe Etiope	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	5
79	Govt. of Australia	24	36	83	2	40	37	1	23	11	72	33	362
80	Govt. of Austria	1	1	0	0	0	0	2	1	3	4	0	12
81	Govt. of Belgium	0	14	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	14
82	Govt. of Brazil	0	0	7	0	0	0	21	0	0	0	1	29
83	Govt. of Canada	0	0	0	6	0	0	2	29	0	14	0	51
84	Govt. of Chile	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
85	Govt. of China	2	8	7	6	3	4	3	10	0	4	5	52
86	Govt. of Czech Republic	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	7
87	Govt. of Finland	1	38	7	1	1	0	0	50	9	36	23	166
88	Govt. Of Finland	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
89	Govt. of France	20	2	22	0	1	6	0	3	12	16	13	95
90	Govt. of Germany	0	25	6	7	1	18	24	1	2	95	0	179
91	Govt. of Hungary	0	2	0	0	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	5
92	Govt. of Ireland	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	5
93	Govt. of Japan	0	5	2	1	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	10
94	Govt. of Netherlands	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	1	5	4	14
95	Govt. of Norway	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
96	Govt. of Republic of Korea	0	3	3	0	17	0	22	0	0	0	0	45
97	Govt. of Spain	10	4	30	0	0	53	6	1	0	0	28	132
98	Govt. of Sweden	0	0	0	1	0	6	1	0	0	2	0	10
99	Govt. of Thailand	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	4
100	Govt. of United Kingdom	4	1	14	0	8	1	0	0	0	21	0	49
101	Govt. of United States of America	46	85	129	50	43	99	45	43	113	18	18	689
102	Graham Feingold	0	17	0	0	0	0	19	0	0	0	0	36
103	Gregory Wiles	0	0	0	0	0	30	0	0	0	0	0	30
104	Guangyu Shi	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
105	Guus Velders	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6
106	Harold Brooks	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5
107	Haroon Kheshgi	0	1	0	0	0	0	3	0	2	10	0	16
108	Hayley Fowler	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2
109	Hendrik M. van Aken	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
110	Herman Sievering	0	2	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	3
111	Hermann Held	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	16	2	0	18
112	Hernan Garcia	0	0	0	0	16	0	0	0	0	0	0	16
113	Hidetaka Sasaki	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	9	9
114	Hongbin Yu	0	16	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	16
115	Howard Freeland	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
116	Howard K. Roscoe	0	14	5	0	0	0	15	0	0	0	0	34
117	Hugo Beltrami	0	0	0	0	0	13	0	0	0	0	0	13
118	Hugo De Backer	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
119	Iain Colin Prentice	0	0	0	0	0	0	38	0	0	0	0	38
120	ian Enting	0	8	0	0	0	3	9	0	0	0	0	20
121	Ian Simmonds	0	0	13	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	13
122	Ibouraïma YABI	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	261	261
123	Ileana Blade	49	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	49
124	ILEANA MARES	0	0	30	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	30
125	Ina Tegen	0	15	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	20
126	Isaac Held	9	6	17	0	0	0	0	2	19	7	0	60
127	Ivan Janssens	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	7
128	J. David Neelin	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6	12	16	34
129	James Annan	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	11	17	0	28
130	James Crampton	0	0	0	0	0	34	0	0	0	0	0	34
131	James Murphy	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	45	45
132	James Renwick	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	65	67

206	Michio Kawamiya	0	0	0	0	6	0	27	0	0	0	33
207	MIKLOS ZAGONI	1	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	5
208	Monika Rhein	0	0	0	0	9	0	0	0	0	0	9
209	Motoyoshi Ikeda	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	4
210	Myriam Khodri	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	6
211	Nathan Gillett	0	104	0	0	0	0	0	15	0	0	119
212	Neil White	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	7
213	Nicolas Gruber	0	0	0	0	36	0	52	0	0	0	88
214	Nikolai Dotzek	1	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6
215	Ola M. Johannessen	0	0	0	23	0	0	0	0	0	0	23
216	Olivier Boucher	0	20	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	21
217	P.C.D. Milly	0	0	9	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	11
218	Pascale BRACONNOT	0	0	0	0	0	21	0	0	0	0	21
219	Pascale DELECLUSE	0	0	7	0	36	0	0	0	14	11	68
220	Patrick Hamill	0	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
221	Patrick Michaels	0	0	19	0	0	1	0	0	0	26	46
222	Paul Baer	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	9	13
223	Paul W Williams	0	0	0	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	8
224	Pedro Ribera	6	0	9	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	15
225	Per Holmund	0	0	0	2	0	2	0	0	0	0	4
226	Pete Falloon	0	0	0	0	0	0	26	0	0	0	26
227	Peter Barrett	0	0	0	0	0	10	0	0	0	0	10
228	Peter Bergamaschi	0	6	0	0	0	0	19	0	0	0	25
229	Peter Stone	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	2	5
230	Peter Thorne	0	0	15	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	17
231	Philip Woodworth	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	5
232	Pierre Friedlingstein	0	0	0	0	0	0	34	0	0	0	34
233	Piers Forster	3	0	0	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	11
234	Qiang Fu	0	0	9	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	9
235	R Allyn Clarke	0	0	0	0	15	0	0	0	0	0	15
236	Raimund Muscheler	0	0	0	0	0	11	0	0	0	0	11
237	Rasmus E. Benestad	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	52	57
238	Ray Weiss	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6
239	Reinhard Böhm	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
240	Renato Spahni	0	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	7
241	Reto Knutti	2	1	0	0	0	13	0	13	0	0	32
242	Richard Allan	23	0	30	0	0	0	0	8	0	0	61
243	Richard B. Alley	0	0	0	0	0	10	0	0	0	15	25
244	Richard Betts	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	19	19
245	Richard Hindmarsh	0	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	0	3	15
246	Richard Soulen	0	3	6	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	11
247	Richard Wood	0	0	0	0	12	0	0	0	3	2	17
248	Robert Kandel	15	1	2	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	19
249	Robert Marsh	0	0	0	0	10	1	0	0	0	1	12
250	Robert Nicholls	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
251	Robert Steven Nerem	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	4
252	Rolf Müller	0	15	0	0	0	1	11	0	0	0	27
253	Ronald J Stouffer	0	0	0	0	0	11	0	0	26	56	151
254	Ronald Prinn	0	5	0	0	0	0	4	0	1	0	10
255	Rosanne D'Arrigo	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	4
256	Ross McKittrick	11	1	10	0	0	14	0	0	1	0	37
257	Roxana Bojariu	0	0	0	9	10	0	0	0	0	3	22
258	Ruth McDonald	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8	5	23	36
259	Sabine Wurzler	1	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4
260	Sandrine Bony	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	12	14
261	Sarah Raper	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	2
262	Savitri GARIVAIT	3	3	0	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	9
263	Scot Martin	0	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
264	Seita Emori	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12	3	6	30
265	Serge PLANTON	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4
266	Shamil Maksyutov	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	3
267	Sharon Smith	0	0	0	57	0	4	0	0	0	15	76
268	Simon Brown	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	10
269	Simon Josey	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1
270	Stefan Brönnimann	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
271	Stefan Rahmstorf	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	2	24	30
272	Stephen J. Hawkins	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	2
273	Stephen McIntyre	2	1	2	0	0	108	0	0	0	0	113
274	Steve Harangozo	0	0	1	10	2	0	0	0	4	13	37
275	Steven Baughcum	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5
276	Steven Siems	1	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5
277	Susan Solomon	0	5	1	3	0	0	1	2	3	6	22
278	Susanna Corti	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	2

279	Takashi Maki	0	2	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	6
280	Teresa Nanni	0	0	4	0	1	0	0	2	0	0	0	7
281	Terrence Joyce	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	1	0	0	0	6
282	Thomas Crowley	0	0	0	0	5	17	0	0	0	0	0	22
283	Thomas Knutson	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	3	0	3	0	14
284	Thomas Peter	0	47	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	47
285	Thomas Vonder Haar	1	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4
286	Tianjun Zhou	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1
287	Timothy Bates	0	3	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	8
288	Tiziano Colombo	1	9	1	1	1	1	1	0	1	0	0	16
289	Twan van Noije	0	0	0	0	0	0	18	0	0	0	0	18
290	Valentin Meleshko	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	6
291	VINCENT GRAY	88	187	216	45	107	131	93	17	572	235	187	1878
292	Vivien Gornitz	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
293	Walter Zenk	0	0	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	0	0	12
294	Wayne F.J. Evans	0	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
295	WG1 TSU	2	1	1	0	2	5	1	0	1	0	0	13
296	Wilfried Haerberli	0	0	0	11	0	1	0	0	0	4	0	16
297	William Collins	0	16	0	0	0	0	20	0	0	0	0	36
298	William Hare	0	21	0	13	0	0	0	0	0	70	0	104
299	William Ingram	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	286	0	0	0	286
300	Wilmer Anderson	27	5	6	1	0	7	1	2	9	4	1	63
301	Wolfgang Lucht	0	0	0	0	0	0	19	0	0	0	0	19
302	Xiaolan L. WANG	0	0	20	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	15	38
303	Xueliang Guo	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
304	Yasuo Sato	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	7
305	Yoko Tsushima	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	5
306	Yukitomo TSUTSUMI	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	4
307	Yusuke Yokoyama	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	4
308	Zhanqing Li	0	8	3	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	13
309	Zong-Ci Zhao	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	2

Total

556 1317 1270 516 672 1232 1047 794 1158 1331 1649 **11542**